The circumstances of this accident were first published in AlB Bulletin No 10/87. Since then additional evidence has become available which significantly affects the original account. The amended version is reprinted below.

No: 12/87 Ref: 4

Aircraft type and registration:

Piper PA 28 Cherokee G-AZEG and Piper PA 28 Cherokee G-BFWK

No & Type of engines:

1 Lycoming 0-320-E2A piston engine and

1 Lycoming 0-320-D3G piston engine

Year of Manufacture:

1971 and 1978 respectively

Date and time (UTC):

10 August 1987 at 1105 hrs

Location:

1.5 nm east of Newtonwards Airport, Northern Ireland

Type of flight:

Training

Persons on board:

Crew — 1:1

Passengers — None

Injuries:

Crew — None

Passengers — N/A

Nature of damage:

G-AZEG: Propeller bent, tyre mark on windscreen.

G-BFWK: Nose wheel collapsed, propeller bent, wing and port

flap damage, fuselage cut by other propeller.

Commander's Licence:

Student Pilot's Licences

Commander's Age:

G-AZEG 44 years G-BFWK 27 years

Commander's Total

Flying Experience:

58 hours and 42 hours (all of which were on type)

Information Source:

Aircraft Accident Report Forms submitted by the pilots.

Both aircraft were engaged in cross-country training exercises. G-AZEG (EG) was departing from Newtownards airfield and G-BFWK (WK) was arriving there from Aldergrove Airport. Runway 22 was in use, and the visibility was in excess of 10 km with no relevant cloud.

EG announced on the RTF "G-EG taking off on runway 22 for Belfast harbour, left turn out." Following a climb straight ahead to 600 feet, EG then turned left crosswind leg, climbing to 1000 feet and again turned left onto 050°, continuing the climb towards 2000 feet. As the aircraft reached a position beyond the abeam point of runway 22 threshold, and at a height stated by the pilot to be approximately 1500 feet, something struck the cockpit windscreen and the propeller, when apparently passing from left to right.

WK was overflying the airfield, on the downwind side, at a height stated by the pilot to be 2000 feet. The pilot had been inspecting the signals square and was intending to cross the threshold of runway 22, at that height, in order to join the left hand circuit on the "dead side" (north west) of the airfield. The pilot stated that the aircraft was "..to the east of the field, abeam the club buildings, when I felt an impact on the aircraft".

Neither of the pilots had seen the other aircraft and it was only following the collision that the pilot of EG saw another aircraft "low and to the right". Both aircraft transmitted Mayday calls.

The pilot of EG discovered that at a particular RPM setting, the engine would run smoothly enough to allow a landing back at Newtonards and so, having made a transmission to that effect, did so in the normal manner, except for using higher engine RPM than usual.

The pilot of WK immediately began an approach to runway 22 but, finding that the flap lever had jammed, performed a right and a left turn to make a landing "in the direction of runway 16".

Since the publication of the previous Bulletin, taken from the WK pilot's Accident Report, new evidence has come to light stating that, far from the "normal landing" quoted in the Accident Report, a very steep approach was made by WK, to touch down off the side of runway 16, followed by a bounce and the collapse of the nose gear, which bent the propeller.